

Reviewer's report

Title: Translating three states of knowledge - discovery, invention & innovation

Version: 1 **Date:** 23 November 2009

Reviewer: Chad Nye

Reviewer's report:

1. This is a very well presented paper. The structure and content are both well conceived and provide an excellent description of the KT models of interest. I can find no substantive criticisms of the manuscript that would merit mandatory or minor essential revision. My only comment that follows is one of style and clarity.

2. Discretionary Revision: The one area of recommendation has to do with the discussion beginning on pg 20 where the authors describe and explain the 3 phases of the NTK model. The descriptions of the Stages, Steps, and Gates are not clear with reference to Figures 1-3. When the authors talk about the Gate for a Stage, it isn't clear if or where in the Action Cycle they are referring. For example on pg 23 the text reads, "Decision Gate 3 following Stage 3 is a very important decision to move from Discovery to Invention."--is the "Gate" simply a move from one Stage to the next or is it a move to one of the points on the Action Circle and if so which one??

My point here is that the reader needs(well at least I need)a bit more guidance on the flow of the discussion based on the Figure.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.